

## EDINBURGH AIRPORT NOISE ADVISORY BOARD

Note of Record - Thirty Sixth Meeting held on Wednesday 5<sup>th</sup> August 2020

By Webex

Commencing at 6.30pm

**Present:** Lindsay Cole, (LC); (Chair)

Merv Archibald (MA), Blackness Area CC; Bruce Finlayson (BF), North Queensferry CC; Ray Flint (RF) Kinghorn CC; Vic Garrard (VG) Kirknewton CC; Sharon Gibson (SG), Pumpherston CC; Ray Godfree (RG), Ratho & District CC; Louise Gunstensen (LG), Dalgety Bay & Hillend CC; Tom Leatherland (TL), Limekilns and Charleston CC; Neil Lovett (NL), East Calder CC, Helena Paul (HP), Blackness Area CC/EAW; Pippa Plevin (PP), Uphall CC; Liz Scobie (LS), Uphall CC; Andrew Watt (AW), Dalkeith & District CC & Midlothian Federation CC; Tom Wylie (TW) Cramond and Barnton CC.

**In attendance:** Mairi Finlayson (MF), North Queensferry CC

**Apologies:** Adam Cumming (AC), Cramond Association;  
Karen Walker (KW), Blackness Area CC;

The Chair welcomed everyone to the meeting.

ITEM		ACTION
1	<p><b>Approval of Previous Minutes</b></p> <p>Draft minutes of the previous “virtual” meeting held on 1<sup>st</sup> July 2020 had been circulated to all members for comment on 14<sup>th</sup> July leading to a final draft circulated on 22<sup>nd</sup> July 2020. Further comment had been raised since (BF) but as no details were presented to the meeting approval was left in abeyance until the comments could be clarified and agreed by the Members.</p> <p>It was noted that as previously agreed, in the absence of a Minute Secretary this meeting would be recorded as a matter of agreed decision and specific actions determined during the meeting.</p>	<p><b>BF</b></p> <p><b>RG</b></p>
2	<p><b>Matters Arising from previous meetings</b></p> <p>It was noted that 29 items are listed as matters arising however many of these items previously listed under Matters Arising are in effect in abeyance pending a resumption of normal meetings and attendance by EAL once COVID-19 restrictions are eased.</p> <p>That being the case it was agreed that subject to any update arising from this meeting and noted below, these items would not be carried forward to forthcoming meetings until such time that they may be reasonably updated and dealt with.</p> <p>These items are therefore included as an appendix to this record.</p> <p>0-----0</p>	

2.1	<p><b>Annual Report</b>  It was noted that an email received this day from EAL had appeared to query the absence of an annual report although it was initially requested by Louise McIntyre (EAL) who is on furlough.  Further to discussion it was agreed that the Chair assisted by LG use a template proposed by AW incorporating comments already made by BF and other Members for discussion at the next general meeting.  <b>Deferred to item 4 on the agenda of this meeting.</b></p>	CHAIR/LG
2.2	<p><b>34.3.1</b>  <b>Q:</b> The Board is experiencing difficulty in contact NATS – is this the result of staff being on furlough?  <b>A:</b> EAL will pass on any queries of provided by EANAB  Noted that EAL (GR) had offered to help a response was delayed.  It was agreed that if information regarding “Runway 06 trial” cannot be obtained from NATS that a FOI will be sent to the CAA.  <b>Noted a FOI request had been put to the CAA and a response was anticipated shortly within the 21 day time limit.</b></p>	Ongoing AW/EAL
2.3	<p><b>34.3.2</b>  EAL have instigated this review and see it as a positive step and as a way of building a relationship with ICCAN, whilst advancing the work of the Board through evolution. The Chair sees it as a way of finding bespoke ways of making things better. It is possible that there may be no change to EANAB and the way it is run (EAL agree that it’s unlikely that ICCAN would suggest the noise board is scrapped) but all view it as an opportunity to examine the process while things are quiet. To this end, a small task force is being set up, co-convened by the EACC and EANAB Chairs. EANAB will be represented on the Task Force but all Members will have their opinions heard. <b>Deferred to item 3 on the agenda of this meeting.</b></p>	CHAIR
2.4	<p>It is understood that ICCAN Guidelines will seek to find the best way for communities to engage with airports and EAL consider it a good opportunity to look at all the present benefits and consider how structures may change. EAL Consider engagement with Community Councils to be the best way to manage this.  It was note that in conjunction with EACC, EANAB should not be looking for off the shelf solutions to re-vamp the Noise Board but need to look globally at how other airports review and approach noise issues and how their noise boards have evolved to best manage this.  <b>Deferred to item 3 on the agenda of this meeting.</b></p>	LC Deal under AOB
2.5	<p><b>34.4.1.2</b>  A query was raised to EAL as to whether Sandy Legget remained on furlough to which EANAB were asked to forward a request for contact details. Contact with GR reply outline to get in touch with SL or Simon Rhodes <b>Noted this ongoing for nearly a year</b></p>	AW Ongoing
2.6	<p>Another consultation feedback closed last week Thanks noted from MA over consultations Note further discussion on Fasi N &amp; Fasi S Procedures for re-classifying airspace consultation just starting to Sept  <b>Ongoing</b></p>	ALL/AW

<p>2.7</p>	<p><b>35.3.1 Governance Sub-Group – Review of Code of Conduct</b></p> <p>Proposed amendments to the CoC had been circulated to members for comment. It was noted that in the absence of an EANAB "Secretary", any references now include the wording, "whom failing, the Vice Chair" and that a new section "E" had been added covering "Complaint Procedure/Breach of the Code of Conduct".</p> <p>Further to discussion it was determined that under Item D4:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The words "at all times" be added to the first sentence</li> <li>• The words " as long as no offence is caused, even if unintentionally" be deleted from item D4, and</li> <li>• The words "and showing respect at all times" be added to item D8</li> </ul> <p>Subject to these changes the Board approved the amended Code of Conduct for issue. <b>CoC Issue 3 issued</b></p>	<p><b>RG/CLOSED</b></p>
<p>2.8</p>	<p><b>35.4.1 Governance Sub-Group – Review of Terms of Reference</b></p> <p>It was noted that in reviewing the present ToR a number of questions were raised by the sub-group. These were listed within an email sent to all members on 26<sup>th</sup> June.</p> <p>During further discussion it was determined that some of the items, such as requiring a "register of stakeholders" were effectively redundant and might be removed. Furthermore it was noted that in the light of recent press reports the Board may wish to consider further clauses relating to statements made or issued to reporters. Other issues noted related to "Annual events", reports and methods for managing tasks and resolution of issues.</p> <p>It was noted that a review of the ToR was timely given the proposed "review" of EANAB by EAL/ICCAN</p> <p>It was agreed that Members should respond to the email to RG with constructive comment by <b>15<sup>th</sup> July</b> so that a preliminary draft of a revised ToR may be prepared for discussion at the next general meeting on 5<sup>th</sup> August</p> <p><b>Noted that only one response to the email of 26<sup>th</sup> June had been received. Deferred to Item 5 of the agenda for this meeting.</b></p>	<p><b>ALL/RG</b></p>
<p>2.9</p>	<p><b>35.5 Article in The Ferret online publication</b></p>	<p><b>HP ONGOING</b></p>
<p>2.10</p>	<p><b>35.5.1</b> Contact RL to establish potential guidelines and ICCAN input.</p> <p><b>35.5.2</b> It was agreed the Chair will contact Gordon Robertson tomorrow to clarify what he means in his press quotes</p>	<p><b>CHAIR ONGOING</b></p>
<p>2.11</p>	<p><b><u>35.6 Updates from Sub Groups</u></b></p>	

2.12	<p><b>Governance</b>  <b>35.6.3.1</b> Following earlier discussion of the CoC and ToR previously discussed it was noted further that the Governance group should consider adding guidelines for the Chair to support him in press query/releases situations.</p>	GSG
2.13	<p><b>35.6.3.2</b>  A statement should be added to the CoC or ToR that everything discussed and presented at the monthly general meetings is deemed to be within the public domain unless specifically stated otherwise.  <b>Noted this should be as standing order for agendas and not a statement in the CoC or ToR</b></p>	GSG/CLOSED
2.14	<p><b>35.6.4 Health</b>  <b>35.6.4.1</b> As noted previously under matters arising a report has been circulated. NHS has offered to provide some data, not yet received and options are being considered.  <b>35.6.4.2</b> It was noted that litigation has been listed (internet) against airports in the USA with regard to Performance Based Navigation (PBN) that often causes issues worldwide.  Link to relevant web site to be provided for EANAB members  <b>Link still to be provided</b></p>	AC/ONGOING  LG
2.15	<p><b>35.6.5 Review of Issues Log</b>  Under <b>AVIATION CONSULTANCY</b> new items 1 &amp; 2 are added, replacing the previous numbered items:  <b>35.6.5.1</b> Noise modelling, a briefing is to be circulated to members and a presentation made at August's meeting which will include information on noise monitors and noise metrics;</p>	MA/BF
2.16	<p><b>Presentation Delayed until September awaiting return of EAL Staff from furlough</b></p>	
2.17	<p><b>35.6.5.2</b> Climb Profiles and Noise, after TO70 work done on profile of flight on noise footprint, there are 2 ways to progress this for EANAB, to ask EAL to fund analysis by TO70 OR we think about asking EAL to ask ERCD to look at this;  <b>Deferred to item 6 of the agenda for this meeting</b></p>	ALL/MA  MA
2.18	<p><b>35.6.5.3</b> It was agreed that a further approach will be made to EAL to ask again for KML files.  <b>Noted EAL have agreed a presentation of KML data to be arranged.</b></p>	AC
2.19	<p><b>35.6.5.4</b> Referring to approaches to EACC and ICCAN, to improve links and joint working it was noted ICCAN are more than happy to join any of our meetings and EACC are to be approached.  <b>Noted a meeting is arranged for Monday next 10<sup>th</sup> August</b></p>	MA/ONGOING
2.20	<p><b>35.6.5.5</b> Short term fixes, to be revisited within the Aviation Sub Group for further information.</p>	CHAIR
2.21		

2.22	<p><b>35.7 Any Other Business</b></p> <p><b>35.7.1</b> Noted that this emphasises the need that EANAB should expedite the Annual Report and not wait until Autumn.  Deferred to item 4 of the Agenda for this meeting</p> <p><b>35.7.2</b> CASPER is not displaying correctly, to be queried with EAL.  Noted that Casper appears to functioning again since the previous day</p> <p><b>35.7.3</b> It was noted a short letter has been drafted based on that which ICCAN produced regarding opportunities to reduce and mitigate noise while the aviation industry is reopening for forwarding to EAL and copy to ICCAN.  Noted a letter was posted – date to be confirmed. No response as yet – letter passed on to others via Hannah Bardell</p>	<p><b>AW/CLOSED</b></p> <p><b>LG/CHAIR</b></p>
3	<p><b>EANAB Review up date and Discussion</b></p> <p>It was noted that the Review Task Force had met on Tuesday 4<sup>th</sup> August, and that notes taken at that meeting had been circulated to EANAB members.  After prolonged discussion it was agreed a letter should be sent to Robert Carr and Kevin Lang inviting them to meet with EANAB at the earliest mutually convenient date so that the Review Task Force could be advised of the opinion of EANAMB members as to the form and structure of the pending Review.</p>	<p><b>HP</b></p>
4	<p><b>EANAB Annual report</b></p> <p>Following discussion the draft Annual report was agreed for issue subject to minor addition and deletion of certain repetitions of text</p> <p>At this time it was agreed that the meeting be suspended to be reconvened at the earliest opportunity subject to the availability of RC KL to attend as discussed under item 3 above with a separate meeting to complete remaining agenda items.</p>	<p><b>LG/CHAIR</b></p> <p><b>CHAIR</b></p>
5	<p><b>Governance Sub Group Terms of Reference Review</b></p> <p>Deferred to a later date subject to confirmation</p>	
6	<p><b>Updates from Sub groups</b></p> <p>Deferred to a later date subject to confirmation</p>	
7	<p><b>AOB</b></p> <p>Deferred to a later date subject to confirmation</p>	

**EDINBURGH AIRPORT NOISE ADVISORY BOARD**

**APPENDIX TO MINUTES OF MEETING 35 – 1<sup>st</sup> July 2020**

**Matters arising from previous meetings to 6<sup>th</sup> May 2020**

ITEM		ACTION
2.1	<p><b>Matters Arising from previous meetings</b></p> <p><b>21.4.4</b> EAL agreed to involve the Aviation Consultancy Sub-Group in discussions with ERDC relating to noise modelling. It was noted that no further progress had been made and that any response received from ERDC would be shared with the sub-group. EAL confirmed that they had escalated this matter as still no progress had been made due to absence of Darren Rhodes. Another prompt will be made next week EANAB will continue to invite dialogue with the groups. This crucial piece of work has been commissioned by EAL but no progress has been made. EAL worked with the sub-group to agree the criteria for the noise modelling, which EAL then commissioned ERCD to carry out; that work is currently ongoing. EANAB are also seeking to speak directly with ERCD but as yet have had no response.</p> <p>To be covered under Noise Map Updates.</p> <p><a href="#">Maps received. Ongoing action for all to look at maps</a></p>	Ongoing All
2.2	<p><b>Updates from Sub-Groups:</b></p> <p><b>28.3.3</b> It was reported that the EACC minutes dated 16 August stated that the Runway 6 trial had been successful and allowed 1 minute separation without additional flight path. EAL agreed to look into this and report back to the Board with details of the trial and its outcomes After discussion it was concluded that the minute was not for 16 August, but from the meeting that took place in August 2016. The response from LMcl (EAL) confirms the August 2016 minutes reference Andrew Mather “talking about an increase in 06 departures and the airport advising that no changes had been made to the flight paths, but the frequency of departures had increased. A trial was carried out in early 2016, however, NATS were unable to collect sufficient data and a report with outcomes was not produced.” It was discussed why the trial may not have been repeated and why the trial was reported as successful. It was suggested that perhaps it did not transfer from NATS to ANS. JM to investigate what happened and request it to be repeated. There remains an option to put the question to the EACC via the representatives from EANAB) It was clarified that a trial was carried out in 2016, but that not enough data was collected and no report was produced. The statement relating to a successful trial was in relation to an unrelated trial. There is no intention for a repeat trial. <a href="#">It was determined that EANAB should consider a direct approach to NATS in attempt to obtain data relating to the runway 06 trial</a></p>	Ongoing AW/RF

2.3	<p><b>Health</b>  <b>29.4.4.1</b>  Meeting arranged with NHS for Thursday 23 January 2020. CAA published in October 2019 a 6 month update on CAP1841 aircraft noise and health effects.  The meeting took place as arranged. To be discussed later under issues log.  Report has been circulated. NHS have offered to provide some data, not yet received. Options being considered.</p>	Ongoing AC
2.4	<p><b>29.4.5.1</b>  <b>Review of Issues Log</b>  Issues Champions are asked to update the history column to make it more relevant and up to date. Sub groups to check issues are captured.  It was noted that some updates had been made and circulated within a new issues of the Log "Working Draft 2020 ISSUES LOG Rev A" to be discussed and noted later at this meeting.</p>	RG Ongoing
2.5	<p>Awaiting responses from Issue Champions</p> <p><b>30.3.1</b>  AW agreed to forward report sent by EANAB to the CAA to RC/EACC. AW had not been aware that this was an action, but will send.</p>	Ongoing AW
2.6	<p>There was no separate EACC submission.  Email received from RC</p>	
2.7	<p><b>30.6.3</b>  The Chair noted that the Planning and Noise report was received from RC and suggested this is dealt with by email outside of the meeting. Waiting to hear back.  Contact with Janice Howgarth of EACC will continue via email</p>	Ongoing LC
2.8	<p><b>31.8</b>  <b>AOB</b>  <b>31.8.2</b> A question was raised as to whether Glasgow have a Noise Board. It was planned for end of 2019. LC to liaise with JH.  LC to determine status of a Glasgow Noise Board under present Coronavirus issues.</p>	Ongoing LC
2.9	<p><b>31.8.6</b>  <b>ACP update.</b>  Further to discussion In view of ongoing uncertainty it was determined that EANAB write formally to the CAA requesting clarity relating to the ACP timetable, and, given the perception that the ACP appears biased towards capacity issues and significant projected growth in air traffic to raise awareness of the potential long term downward impact of the present coronavirus. ACP suspended until further notice</p>	CHAIR In abeyance
	<p><b>The New Situation/The Way Forward</b></p>	ALL/MA Ongoing



2.10	<p><b>32.3.1</b> The EANAB – MA offered to collate Member’s comments for uploading to the website to inform Communities of continuing EANAB effort in relation to aviation noise.</p>	
2.11	<p><b>32.3.2</b> The impact on the ACP to be clarified by writing formally to the CAA requesting clarity relating to the ACP timetable.(see Item 2.19 above), and, given the perception that the ACP appears biased towards capacity issues and significant projected growth in air traffic to raise awareness of the potential long term downward impact of the present coronavirus. <b>ACP suspended until further notice</b></p>	<p><b>CHAIR</b> <b>In abeyance</b></p>
2.12	<p><b>32.3.3</b> Noted that whilst EAL are impacted by the immediate downturn in demand a window of opportunity exists for EANAB to continue activities and to promote its concerns and ideas to both the CAA and ICCAN</p> <p><b>Review of Issues Log</b></p>	<p><b>Ongoing</b> <b>ALL</b></p>
2.13	<p><b>32.6</b> Whilst “New issues” are invited from Members at any time, in the first instance, all members listed against each and every Issue are asked to feedback current update information so that the Log may be completed to reflect the current status quo. <b>Awaiting responses from Issue Champions</b></p>	<p><b>ALL/RG</b> <b>Ongoing</b></p>
2.14	<p><b>Annual Report</b></p> <p><b>32.7.1</b> It was noted that whilst any immediate pressure to submit the report to EAL was reduced allowing time to perfect the final issue it would be pertinent to complete the report as soon as possible. A draft copy is to be circulated for discussion/comment. <b>Draft issued</b></p>	<p><b>Chair</b> <b>Ongoing</b></p>
2.15	<p><b>32.7.2</b> Further to recent events it was agreed that the Governance sub-group review the EANAB Code of Conduct with a view to introducing measures for controlling potential breaches of the Code and a mechanism for addressing complaints. <b>The Governance Group is in the process of refining draft changes to the ToR and CoC for subsequent issue to the Board for approval</b></p>	<p><b>RG</b> <b>Ongoing</b></p>
2.16	<p><b>32.7.3</b> It was noted that a document charting the process of determining design principles for the ACP appeared to conclude principles that in some cases ignored basic principles established in consultations. As an example, an intent of “No Change to Flightpaths” appears to be ignored in final conclusions Members were asked to draw attention of the Chair to similar issues so that the CAA might be informed by letter.</p>	<p><b>Ongoing</b> <b>ALL/CHAIR</b></p>
2.17	<p><b>32.7.5</b> It was noted that feedback/comment is still required relating to an email on Planning Issues circulated previously. The email to be circulated to all members as a reminder.</p>	<p><b>Ongoing</b> <b>BF/ALL</b> <b>CHAIR</b></p>
2.18	<p><b>32.7.7</b> A draft email to EAL, prepared requesting minimal funding to EANAB to cover costs of a minutes secretary is to be circulated for comment and further action.</p>	
	<p><b>33.5</b></p>	<p><b>ALL/MA</b></p>



