

EDINBURGH AIRPORT NOISE ADVISORY BOARD

Note of Record – Forty Fourth Meeting held on Wednesday 7th April 2021

By internet link

Commencing at 6.30pm

Present: Lindsay Cole (Chair)

Merv Archibald (MA), Blackness Area CC; Adam Cumming (AC) Cramond Association; Bruce Finlayson (BF), North Queensferry CC; Sharon Gibson (SG), Pumpherston CC; Ray Godfree (RG), Ratho & District CC; Tom Leatherland (TL), Limekilns and Charleston CC; Neil Lovett (NL) East Calder CC; Pippa Plevin (PP), Joint Forum of Community Councils in West Lothian; Karen Walker (KW) Blackness Area CC; Andrew Watt (AW), Dalkeith & District CC & Midlothian Federation CC; Tom Wylie (TW) Cramond and Barnton CC; Helena Paul (HP), Blackness Area CC/EAW; Louise Gunstensen (LG), Dalgety Bay & Hillend CC; Vic Garrad (VC) Kirknewton CC

In attendance: Simon Rhodes (SR) EAL, Gordon Robertson (GR) EAL, Mari Finlayson (MF) North Queensferry CC

Apologies: Ray Flint (RF) Kinghorn CC

The Chair welcomed members to the meeting.

ITEM		ACTION
1	Approval of Previous Minutes The March 2021 minutes were not accepted because of the reasons given below.	TBC
1.1	Issues were raised about the process for checking and amending of the minutes for final acceptance as two members raised issues with the draft minutes insofar that they considered some items were not included and it was suggested that the minutes had been contended now at each meeting since January and that the minutes secretary step aside from minute taking. The minutes secretary stated that amended minutes with added items from the February meeting had been distributed with no further comment before publication. This was challenged and the minutes secretary referred to the email sent to him and the Chair on 26 th March 2021 (copied to the board) and which was resent on 5 th April. It was again proposed that the current minutes secretary step aside so minutes could be approved in a less contentious manner. The minutes secretary stated the minutes were being done to the best of their ability with some help and withdrew from the meeting. <u>A board member stepped in to produce minutes with EAL note taking.</u> The point was noted that minutes produced were not an accurate record for reasons discussed.	KW/SR
1.2	It was also raised that at February's meeting a decision was made not to allow members access to recordings of the meetings however it was felt that not all information required to make that decision was available at that time. It was	

	<p>proposed that this subject should be revisited at the next meeting.</p> <p>EAL offered to gain the view of a Data Protection officer regarding recordings being made for clarification. It was noted that public planning meetings were recorded and publicly available & if nobody blocks it, access could proceed however since EANAB meetings are not public there may be an issue with this. If any one person objects, it is their right to do so. It was noted that meetings have, prior to the February 2021 meeting, been recorded and were accessible to members with no issue. Contention has since arisen because access has been restricted and it was felt by several members that recent minutes were not an accurate reflection of what had happened but are now unable to verify them.</p> <p>It was suggested that for a lay person to understand the situation, it does require as much information as possible and it would be helpful for EAL to provide clarification on GDPR and recording issues.</p> <p>A proposal was made that recordings be made available to board members only to ensure accuracy of meeting minutes.</p> <p><u>EAL confirmed they will provide information in writing/email on the recording issue by drawing attention to the relevant documentation or legal paragraphs to help inform the board.</u></p> <p>The Chair confirmed that the March minutes will be put on hold for now.</p>	<p>GR</p> <p>TBC</p>
<p>2</p>	<p>Matters Arising</p> <p>Move to agenda item 5. After brief discussion, it was agreed to try a suggested new running order by referring to matters arising where necessary through the agenda items and only address those not covered during the meeting before AOB.</p> <p>This will be on a trial basis for a few months.</p>	
<p>3</p>	<p>EANRP up-date</p> <p>There was a review panel (RP) meeting yesterday.</p> <p>The board were updated on the survey responses, assuring EANAB members they could take part and the interview process was outlined. Individual responsibilities of the review panel were looked at regarding the survey analysis and who had responded. The Board were informed that EAL had circulated their response to members and that any member who wished to give feedback on EAL's response was encouraged to give that feedback by Tuesday 12th April to the RP. The period of analysis should be completed by the end of April followed by weekly meetings and then recommendations. The detail of yesterday's meeting was on how this would be achieved. The meetings have been constructive, and the conveners allow input from all. Some responses to the survey may be followed up for clarification purposes. People responding had been grouped to help with analysis.</p> <p>There have been 91 responders including EANAB members. GR indicated that he felt this was a good response and is happy with the process.</p> <p>EANAB members have 2 weeks for further engagement using the relevant email address.</p>	
<p>4</p>	<p>Gordon Robertson – Re-opening of the ACP</p> <p>GR gave thanks for the meeting invite and stated he was prepared to answer any questions.</p>	

	<p>Airport update: Minus 98.7% passengers with no real roadmap out for the industry. The comms team has reduced over time in a difficult period. Looking for domestic travel to open up towards the end of May. International travel later with limited opportunity in the summer (possibly 2022 for some countries). Hotel quarantine and travel restrictions is with us for a few months yet but hoping for some kind of recovery in the summer. International travel is driven by friends and family as well as some business travel. Not much demand for holidays yet.</p> <p>EAL are looking to restart the ACP and the DfT have made some funds available for this, stage 2 specifically (the options stage). The process for allocating funding is still to be worked out. ACOG is tasked with this and EAL have a meeting with the CAA on Monday to restart the ACP. The CAA have limited resource therefore the meeting is to clarify the restart process and timescales. Stage 2 is very involved and is complicated by how EAL can engage in a Covid safe manner. EANAB is a valued key stakeholder and will be involved.</p> <p>The NAP is due for renewal in 2023 and EAL is planning to combine some work for both the ACP and NAP. NATS will need to do an ACP to open up the Forth and EAL need to work with them to achieve this. SR is now running the ACP in his new position as Head of Airspace and liaising with EANAB, airlines, NATS and noise issues etc.</p> <p>EAL are also working to answer issues with the MoD over their ACP to the east which has gone in.</p> <p>ICCAN have published their corporate strategy on the future of aviation noise and how that affects EAL is to be looked at. <u>EAL willing to present to EANAB on this in the next month or two</u> to provoke a discussion on the future of aviation noise.</p> <p>EANAB are keen to be involved in issues with flightpaths out to the east (Forth). NATS are also looking at these issues. <u>EAL will keep EANAB up to date and involved with these issues through the Aviation sub-group and will be updated by SR</u> at their bi-monthly meetings and any input requested when needed.</p> <p>There are issues with ACP's being joined together, interdependent and co-dependant and there are ideas that NATS have about efficiency. It is thought that the MoD and NATS should be generally supportive of the Forth option. CAP1616 (Part 3) is dedicated to transparency and engagement and <u>EAL are happy to provide monthly ACP updates.</u></p> <p>It was asked if there would be conditions related to the distribution of DfT public money? EAL would like to clarify this at their next CAA meeting. The money is to do with decarbonisation and EAL are unsure as to how this limited pot of money will be allocated.</p> <p>There was a query <u>if the profile modelling could be kickstarted as soon as possible?</u> This would be part of what EAL need to do as part of stage 2 options and is dependent on the recovery process.</p> <p>Other questions to EAL prompted the following answers:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • EAL paused the ACP before the gateway meeting for stage 1 and is still in pause. • The Statement of Need (SoN) will still stand as far as EAL are concerned although things have changed post Covid and the CAA may ask them to review it. • The reduction in passenger numbers of 98% is compared to March 2019 as March 2020 is not a representative example. • EAL hope that the MoD's attitude should be to accommodate their ACP as the MoD ACP will be temporary in time. NATS are bringing free 	<p>EAL</p> <p>SR/ Aviation SG</p> <p>SR</p> <p>Action 40.5.1 Ongoing</p>
--	--	--

	<p>route airspace in over Scotland and this will be discussed at the subgroup.</p> <p>When asked how the airport will mitigate for noise as it opens, EAL answered by contributing to ICCAN's work, through the ACP and engaging with communities. This is something to discuss as the recovery progresses. EANAB are keen to offer ideas <u>and EAL will come back to talk about the issue of noise mitigation when they can</u>. This includes ICCAN and best practice.</p> <p>Whilst acknowledging recovery mode/furloughed staff at EAL, it was noted that communities are already concerned about night flights and a query if the air cargo flights might be the culprits of not having the Fuel Over Pressure Plates (FOPP)? EAL have checked with airlines and this is controlled under airline policies most of which have this modification on aircraft.</p> <p><u>Any that might not have FOPP modifications (eg night cargo aircraft) are to be clarified.</u></p> <p>EAL were reminded that a "build back better" letter had been sent last summer and a <u>response is still awaited</u>. It was again stressed that people do seem to be more sensitive to noise as a result of this down time.</p> <p>The final point discussed was GR's press announcement of ICCAN's involvement in the review of EANAB. The statement was made following a discussion that GR had with Rob Light of ICCAN at that point in time about best practice in setting up a review panel and wanted to learn from Gatwick's experience however further discussion led to Robert Carr taking the lead of the RP.</p>	<p>GR</p> <p>Action 43.8.1 closed</p> <p>SR/ Aviation SG</p> <p>Action 35.7.3 -EAL</p> <p>Action 35.5.2 closed</p>
5	<p>Discussion on Repositioning and Handling of Matters Arising</p> <p>(This item was discussed earlier in meeting)</p>	
6	<p>Up-Dates from Sub groups</p>	
6.1	<p>AVIATION</p> <p>The next Aviation subgroup meeting is later this month.</p>	
6.2	<p>The New Issues LOG</p> <p>There have been a couple of meetings of the subgroup now led by TW. Thanks, and appreciation are expressed to RG on creating and maintaining the log so far. The group will be called the Strategic Review subgroup and the log is now the Strategic Review Log. The meetings will look at EANAB and the work it is doing, concentrating on strategy and keeping the log updated with regular input from other subgroups. The group will have quarterly meetings and should be high on the EANAB monthly meeting agenda when required. The most pressing issue is the annual review, looking at how things have progressed and gone on and the works that are progressing.</p> <p>Board members to refer to the email circulated from TW on 2 April 2021. <u>Feedback requested on ideas for the group via email.</u></p> <p><u>The annual review is to be completed by the end of this month. Sub-group leaders to respond quickly.</u></p> <p>A suggestion was made that the annual review, annual report and annual meeting should be coordinated and establish core objectives.</p>	<p>Action 42.7 closed</p> <p>All to respond to email</p> <p>SG leaders</p> <p>Action- TBC</p>

6.3	<p>ICCAN ICCAN have published their corporate strategy for 2021-2024. They have also published a report on the future of aviation noise management. <u>It would be a good idea to review this report.</u> HP has been involved the review process and is continuing on the advisory board on the national survey of noise attitudes. ICCAN also held a workshop into the health impacts of noise (see below).</p>	ICCAN SG
6.4	<p>HEALTH Two board members attended the ICCAN virtual workshop on the health impacts of noise. No members of the Scottish Government attended. The report is awaited and will develop discussion. This was worthwhile as it builds contacts between Airport consultation groups and ICCAN. <u>Precis of the ICCAN health report (2020) to be published per action 41.5.5.1</u></p>	AC/PP
6.5	<p>GOVERNANCE Ref items 10, 12 and 16 of the matters arising and an email report circulated 7 April 2021: There have been discussions with Scottish Mediation who were helpful and willing to provide a mediator for the two issues and a special meeting (details of pro bono hours in email). Separate mediators could be provided for each issue or if appropriate and available, could be handled by one. <u>Board members to feedback on the document sent earlier today to progress the governance issues (now grouped under action 43.5.1).</u> Discussion with the RP has confirmed that governance issues should continue to be managed by the board whilst the review process is still ongoing. Any future recommendations are subject to acceptance by both EANAB and EAL. A member confirms mediation does work whilst two others agreed that no downside could be seen in accepting the mediation route. A second complaint has arisen but both parties have not yet been informed. The 2-week governance rule for treating a complaint was highlighted. Chair to take this forward as the governance group is not operational. <u>Chair to inform both parties of the situation and arrange for an ad hoc group to look at the complaint.</u> <u>Any volunteers for the ad hoc group to contact the Chair (minimum of 3 people required).</u></p>	<p>Action 43.5.1 All EANAB members</p> <p>CHAIR All EANAB members</p>
(2)	<p>Matters arising/outstanding Matters from the action list not covered in discussions above: Action item 5 (30.6.3) Action item 6 (32.7.3) Action item 15 (43.4.3) Action item 19 (43.8.2) Action item 20 (43.8.3) Updated progress or new actions are noted for these items in blue on the Matters Arising/Outstanding table below. It was commented that the new running order of the meeting was effective and would be tried again next time.</p>	

7	AOB	
7.1	<p>Drumshoreland residential planning proposal: draft letter prepared and circulated to the board on 5 April 2021. Some work was requested from EAL and GR agreed both parties should work together on such matters. <u>EANAB to liaise with EAL to finalise the letter.</u></p> <p>Instead of firefighting case by case, a request was made of EAL to see their land use planning and strategy so that EANAB could move forward with more structured responses in the future and have a position. EAL is engaging with the City Council which is refreshing various plans for western Edinburgh. <u>EAL will look at how best to present this and agreed to liaise/report back moving forward on planning.</u></p>	<p>42.9.3 MA/RG/JMcC</p> <p>EAL</p>
7.2	<p>The North Queensferry MP has approached NQCC and would support EANAB with the Forth option (including the MoD ACP though caution needed so that any MoD ACP and future airspace does not affect any options that Edinburgh has). EAL are already in communication with MPs. The CAP1616 process has to be followed and elected officials will be informed and EANAB would be kept in the loop about progress with the ACP. The CAP1616 is about improvement, options and engagement to provide the best solution. EAL has to demonstrate that they have considered all flight paths options balancing competing needs between noise, carbon and whilst keeping safety. <u>The CAP1616 process involves engagement and transparency throughout. EANAB as a stakeholder will be updated with all discussions at board meetings</u> (as discussed in section 4 above).</p>	<p>EAL Ongoing</p>
7.3	<p>SR was thanked for the EAL responses provided to the Aviation sub-group. There is opportunity through the Strategic group to correlate a more effective way to work.</p>	<p>Action - TBC</p>
7.4	<p>The Blackness community have noted disturbance from Edinburgh-to-Edinburgh flights. These flights are ongoing for engineering or pilot currency purposes. They could also be for crew training and because of the expense are probably a combination of these.</p>	
	<p>Thanks were expressed to GR and SR for attending today's meeting.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Date of Next Meeting Subject to confirmation, the next meeting of the Board will be held on Wednesday 5th May 2021</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Meeting closed at 21.02</p>	

Matters arising/outstanding actions and new actions

Item	ID	Matter arising/action description	Responsible	Date raised	Date closed
1	35.5.2	GR to attend a meeting to clarify his press announcement and ICCANs involvement in the review. GR had a discussion with ICCAN about best practice in setting up a review panel and wanted to learn from Gatwick's experience.	CHAIR/GR	July 2020	7 April 2021
2	35.7.3	Letter regarding opportunities to reduce and mitigate noise while the aviation industry is reopening was sent by Chair mid-July 2020 to EAL, CAA & Hannah Bardell. No responses yet received. Noted many staff in EAL are on furlough and the same is likely for CAA staff. Remains dormant awaiting response Reminder discussed & response from EAL requested	CHAIR EAL	July 2020 April 2021	
3	39.4	A draft letter to be circulated for board approval addressed to MPs and MSPs (including Alex Cole Hamilton) exploring the potential for further funding. To be sent after the 6th May elections	AC AC/ALL	Nov 2020 Apr 2021	
4	41.2.11	Minutes Secretary No further funds available from CCs. Ongoing Action: volunteers welcome. EAL to continue to provide the in-house notes secretary.	Ongoing/ALL	Nov 2020	
5	30.6.3	The Chair noted that the Planning and Noise report was received from RC of EACC and suggested this is dealt with by email outside of the meeting. Subsequent to contact with EACC will continue via email. JH to report back once she has met with RC to get clarification. JH and RC cannot recollect this matter. LG to review and email the Chair	Ongoing Chair LG/Chair	Feb 2020 Apr 2021	
6	32.7.3	It was noted that a document charting the process of determining design principles for the ACP appeared to conclude principles that in some cases ignored basic principles established in consultations. As an example, an intent of "No Change to Flightpaths" appears to be ignored in final conclusions. Awaiting reactivation of ACP	ALL/CHAIR ONGOING	Apr 2020	
7	40.5.1	Aviation Consultancy Sub-Group Dates were awaited from EAL to meet to develop EAL/EANAB co-operation on the ACP and the benefits of flight profiling. <i>EAL is in contact with ACOG and is awaiting information on re-activating the ACP together with feedback from the DfT;</i>	SR (EAL) ONGOING	Dec 2020	

		<i>regarding requests for funding.</i> Ongoing	EAL(SR) ONGOING		
8	41.5.5.1	Health SG <i>Precis of the ICCAN report to be uploaded to EANAB website</i>	PP/AC	Apr 2021	
9	42.7	REVIEW OF ISSUES LOG There was a meeting on the 19th January with the new subgroup and another meeting is to be arranged. Ongoing with volunteers required. Now under the Strategic Review sub group	BF/AC/MA ONGOING	3 Feb 2021	7 April 2021
10	42.9.1	ANY OTHER BUSINESS Noting that a board member has recently resigned it was requested that members consider the issues raised within the resignation email for discussion in full at the next meeting in March. Deferred to separate meeting to be arranged for all Members to discuss the broader sense of governance. See item 12 below Grouped with governance/complaint items below, item 43.5.1	CHAIR BF	3 Feb 2021 3 Mar 2021 7 April 2021	Now action 43.5.1
11	42.9.3	Further to discussion on Planning matters noted above under section 6 it was agreed that a draft letter to West Lothian Planning be prepared regarding the proposed development at Drumshoreland Road/Clapperton Hall. EAL (JMCC) to provide assistance when able. Draft letter circulated 5 April 2021 by RG & supported for sending. EANAB to liaise with EAL to finalise the letter.	LG/RG/JMCC MARG/JMCC	3 Feb 2021 April 2021	
12	42.9.4	Following ongoing questions regarding the position of the Chair, as an alleged conspirator, continuing to manage the meeting it was determined that an action arising should be the arrangement of a special meeting with an independent Chair to discuss the Complaint raised in July 2020 together with the issues arising from documents as issued to members by the Complainant in November 2020. <i>It was noted this could be covered within a broader meeting of members incorporating issues related to a Complaint as noted above in item 22 of this schedule</i> Grouped with resignation issue above and combined to come under "Arrangements for a separate meeting on governance" item 43.5.1	CHAIR/BF BF	3 Feb 2021 3 Mar 2021 7 April 2021	Now action 43.5.1
13	43.4.1	Future Combat Airspace ACP SR gave a presentation on this Future Combat Airspace, Night Noise and the Noise Action Plan (NAP). The presentation would be distributed after the meeting.	SR/EAL	3 Mar 2021	7 April 2021
14	43.4.2	SR was asked about additional fees at night and also WHO guidance on "night time hours" and will		3 Mar 2021	

		<p>come back to the next meeting with some information.</p> <p>Email circulated on 3 March by a board member with night fee details and any further questions will be routed through the Aviation sub-group</p>	SR/EAL		7 April 2021
15	43.4.3	<p>Some further discussion would take place in the sub-group on the definition of night and the further questions.</p> <p>The DfT consultation response from EANAB was submitted on 3 March 2021 and it was highlighted that any opportunity to influence the DfT is important.</p> <p><u>Question: which regulations govern the definition of “night-time”?</u> Chair to advise.</p> <p>A need to fully understand why there is a difference (of 1.5 hours) between EAL and WHO night-time hours is expressed. This definition is important for communities here as the peak hour for noise is 6-7am.</p> <p><u>EAL wants to be clear and have a discussion on this.</u> It could be part of the ACP.NAP or do they change to WHO definitions?</p>	<p>TL</p> <p>Chair</p> <p>EAL</p>	<p>3 Mar 2021</p> <p>7 April 2021</p> <p>7 April 2021</p>	
16	43.5.1	<p>Arrangements for a separate meeting on governance</p> <p>This will be an extraordinary meeting and set up by BF, who will look at available dates and who may be available to chair the meeting.</p> <p><u>Board members to feedback on the email issued today with mediation options to progress the governance issues</u></p>	BF ALL	<p>3 Mar 2021</p> <p>7 April 2021</p>	
17	43.6.1	<p>Review of Issues Log</p> <p>There is currently no issues sub group. BF, AC, MA and TL along with TW will take this away from this meeting to discuss the way forward.</p> <p>TL proposed a plan was required for work going forward in 2021 and a review is required for what was achieved in 2020. A summary from each sub-group detailing this work should be sent to MA for compilation.</p> <p><u>All actions now under Strategic Review sub-group</u></p>	<p>BF/AC/MA/TL</p> <p>MA/Group Champions</p>	<p>3 Mar 2021</p> <p>3 Mar 2021</p>	7 April 2021
18	43.8.1	<p>AOB</p> <p>Fuel Over Pressure Plates.</p>			

		SR will research this further for the next meeting & clarify what EAL are doing to encourage all airlines to make this alteration. Post March meeting note: <i>Information on this was received since the meeting: EasyJet can confirm that this is fitted to all their aircraft (They are a modification for the Airbus 320 family only so not relevant for Boeings etc.) Most if not all of the A320 have them</i>	SR/EAL SR/EAL	3 Mar 2021	7 April 2021
19	43.8.2	Digital Library. BF proposed to create a digital library on the EANAB website in conjunction with another board member. PP volunteered to assist. This would be relatively simple on a separate tab if required (like the current ICCAN tab for instance). See below	BF/PP	3 Mar 2021	7 April 2021
20	43.8.3	A request was made for all members to send through any relevant documentation. KW offered to assist in compiling a list of documentation for ease of access when required. See below BF, KW and PP have compiled some documents in to a digital library. BF demonstrated the contents page, the documents held within and how to access these. <u>The library will be built up over time and any contributions would be appreciated.</u>	ALL/KW All (ongoing task)	3 Mar 2021	7 April 2021
NEW ACTIONS					
	44.1	March 2021 minutes to be approved	TBC	7 April 2021	
	44.1.1	KW and SR to take over production of minutes until formal minutes secretary funds are reinstated	KW/SR	7 April 2021	
	44.1.2	EAL to provide information in writing/email on the recording issue by drawing attention to the relevant documentation or legal paragraphs.	EAL/GR	7 April 2021	
	44.4	EAL to present to EANAB on how ICCAN's published corporate strategy on the future of aviation noise will affect EAL in the next month or two	EAL	7 April 2021	
	44.4	SR to keep EANAB up to date and involved with the Forth issues/NATS discussions through the Aviation sub-group	SR/Aviation SG	7 April 2021	
	44.4 & 44.7.2	CAP1616 (Part 3) is dedicated to transparency and engagement and EAL are happy to provide monthly ACP updates.	SR	7 April 2021	
	44.4	EAL to come back to EANAB when they can to discuss their plans for noise mitigation as the airport opens up	EAL/GR	7 April 2021	
	44.4	Any aircraft that might not have FOPP modifications (eg night cargo aircraft) are to be clarified	SR to Aviation SG	7 April 2021	
	44.4	"Build back better" letter response from EAL to EANAB awaited		7 April 2021	

44.6.2	All to read email from TW (2 April 2021) & feedback is requested on ideas for the Strategic Review sub group via email	ALL	7 April 2021	
44.6.2	The annual review is to be completed by the end of this month. Sub-group leaders to provide information to MA quickly.	ALL	7 April 2021	
44.6.3	ICCAN report on the future of aviation noise management now available and to be reviewed	ICCAN SG	7 April 2021	
44.6.5	Chair to inform both parties of a new complaint and arrange for an ad hoc group to look at it.	Chair	7 April 2021	
44.6.5	Volunteers required for ad hoc group to look at new complaint (please email the Chair)	ALL	7 April 2021	
44.7.1	EAL to liaise/report back to EANAB with reference to EALs land use planning and strategy	EAL	7 April 2021	