

EDINBURGH AIRPORT NOISE ADVISORY BOARD

Note of Record – Forty Fifth Meeting held on Wednesday 5th May 2021

Via Webex

Commencing at 6.30pm

Present: Lindsay Cole (Chair)

Merv Archibald (MA), Blackness Area CC; Adam Cumming (AC) Cramond Association; Bruce Finlayson (BF), North Queensferry CC; Sharon Gibson (SG), Pumpherston CC; Tom Leatherland (TL), Limekilns and Charleston CC; Neil Lovett (NL) East Calder CC; Pippa Plevin (PP), Joint Forum of Community Councils in West Lothian; Karen Walker (KW) Blackness Area CC; Andrew Watt (AW), Dalkeith & District CC & Midlothian Federation CC; Tom Wylie (TW) Cramond and Barnton CC; Helena Paul (HP), Blackness Area CC/EAW; Louise Gunstensen (LG), Dalgety Bay & Hillend CC; Vic Garrad (VC) Kirknewton CC;

In attendance: Simon Rhodes (SR) EAL, Mari Finlayson (MF) North Queensferry CC

Apologies: Ray Flint (RF) Kinghorn CC, Ray Godfree (RG), Ratho & District CC

ITEM		ACTION
1.1	Approval of Previous Minutes and Public Domain Reminder The April 2021 minutes were accepted by TL and seconded by MA.	
1.2	March 2021 minutes still to be approved.	Chair
2	Short debate on recordings This item was discussed later in the meeting when further EANAB members had joined the meeting. Some board members were disappointed with the response to the expert input regarding access to recordings of this meeting and queried why some were trying to shut down accountability. EANAB should be as transparent with the communities as possible and therefore the minutes should be accurate and available. The practical outcome of removing access to the recordings of the minutes has the real effect of shutting down accountability. Recordings were taken in the past which were available to members only and accessed on only one occasion. The minutes taken in the past were accurate. The issue of recording, when discussed in February, was that some members thought the board were breaking GDPR which is why expert advice was sought. A few other points were raised: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• it was felt that some of the wording in emails circulated regarding this subject had been disrespectful;• there was some concern regarding consent or could this be a red herring?	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some had concern over lack of control of recordings if widely distributed. <p>Expert GDPR advice from two professional sources has now been forwarded to all members of the board (email dated 26 April 2021). In order to move forward with this issue, it was suggested the board approve the email sent to all board members by another member on 1 May 2021 which proposed that in light of the new information forwarded to the board by the EAL GDPR team and the QC's legal opinion, the recording is also made available, on request, to any Board member who was present and who wishes to refresh their memory as to what they said to ensure the minute correctly records that. This proposal leaves what the Board agreed in February in place and simply adds a further specific purpose which is that a board member can ask to hear a relevant part of the meeting through the minutes secretary, and the recording destroyed after final approval/publication of the minutes. It is an offence to leak any confidential recordings. It was agreed that the Board is public and should be transparent.</p> <p>The minutes secretary should liaise with the meeting facilitator for the recordings of meetings and if anyone attending that meeting requires access to recorded information, they should liaise with the minutes secretary.</p>	KW/PP/ALL
3	<p>EANRP up-date</p> <p>There had been technical issues with gathering the responses however these are now sorted, and the responses have been split into three sets - from:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> the noise board, individuals and community councils. <p>The next stage is to analyse these responses with the workload being split amongst members of the review panel and then produce collated information that will be included in the final report. There is no particular timescale in mind, but the next meeting is Tuesday 11th May. Interviews ongoing with a large workload to get through.</p> <p>One member queried why they had not yet received an interview date despite responding positively to the relevant email. Chair to check with the RP.</p>	Chair
4	<p>Annual Report</p> <p>The first task for the strategic sub-group would be to publish the annual report for 2020. There is a first draft and the chairman's report was received earlier in the day. Any feedback/comments on a draft to be circulated asap is requested from board members by 12th May with a view to distributing a final draft a week after this. The final report would be completed by the end of ay. TW was thanked for the work so far.</p> <p>All members to feedback on drafts of the Annual Report before final publication.</p>	ALL
5	<p>Up-Dates from Subgroups</p>	
5.1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Aviation <p>This had been a busy month with minutes from the previous meeting circulated today. There is a lot in this minute so could board members review and pass comment on the email of 5 May 2021. The sub-group has been working on a</p>	ALL

	detailed work plan to be shared with the board. This includes work with ICCAN. The list of work is growing, and the actions list is to be updated.	
5.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New Issues Log/Strategic <p>This group is looking at a more strategic way of working by analysing the work each subgroup is doing starting with the aviation subgroup who carry out a high percentage of the work that EANAB does. The format of the ICCAN strategy document will be used for consistency. There is no timescale set but the group meets on a quarterly basis and is looking to provide a strategy for the aviation subgroup at the next board meeting.</p>	
5.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ICCAN <p>The UK survey on noise is ongoing. How can ICCAN help the board with their work? Board members are invited to suggest items or work of interest. Would EANAB like to hear from Charles Lloyd (a member of the Gatwick noise executive) for an exchange of ideas? There were further suggestions for experts to also input to the board. It is important for the board to understand the UK airspace policy. It would be useful to have an overview of ANEG for both the board and EAL (webpage link circulated to the board for the Airspace and Noise Engagement Group – a formal channel of communication between the DfT and airspace and noise stakeholders). Could board members get back to the ICCAN subgroup about what they require or would like to hear from Charles Lloyd, ANEG and/or ICCAN.</p> <p>The board is responding to the CAA consultation on night flying (31st May deadline) and the aviation subgroup is to liaise with the ICCAN subgroup.</p> <p>New information regarding training offered by the CAAi on noise management and noise modelling was flagged and it was proposed that these courses could be funded by EAL. The CAA are expanding their services into consultancy also. Training would be done as part of an agreed workplan. CAAi training information to be circulated to the board.</p>	<p>ALL</p> <p>MATL/HP</p> <p>BF</p>
5.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Health <p>The subgroup has contributed to the annual report. A conversation has taken place with Christine Jardine (MP) regarding night noise, health effects and the possibility of a central Scottish airport. Another meeting is to be set up regarding this.</p> <p>EANAB are not able to address health concerns and are a gateway for information only, it was agreed that board members should be clear about this to their communities. Members are doing what they can and will attend any further workshops with ICCAN and feedback from these. Feedback from the last workshop will be distributed internally within the group once received. In the future experts, may be consulted and this should be an aim of the board. It may also be worthwhile approaching the Royal Society of Edinburgh for advice. There are currently resource issues, but these may ease in the future for this very important topic.</p>	<p>AC/KW</p> <p>AC</p>
5.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Governance 	

	<p>This subgroup was put into abeyance in December, but the review panel suggested the group carries on. There was discussion about previous volunteers and the number of board members to make up the subgroup which should be an odd number. Five people would be an appropriate number as it is always difficult to arrange suitable times for meetings. The point was made that the board was divided but things should move forward with reasonable discussion and the decision with who is on the subgroup rests with the board.</p> <p>Any volunteers for the reconstitution of the Governance subgroup to send an email.</p>	<p>Volunteers to email AC/BF</p>
<p>5.6</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ACP Update <p>The Air Traffic Management and Unmanned Aircraft Act was passed on April 29th which means that the Secretary of State can now instruct sponsors to carry out an ACP. EAL have DfT money via the CAA for the ACP which may provide issues in the future when the CAA assesses EAL's ACP. A restart guidance table has been submitted to the CAA and EAL await CAA approval to carry on with the ACP. Funding is only provided for stages 1 and 2 in both this financial year (two thirds) and the next financial year (the remaining third of the money). As part of the restart, a plan is required to engage with stakeholders and update our stage 1 documentation for resubmission in July (subject to this timeline being approved by the CAA). Stage 2 will provisionally be submitted in July 2022. EAL meeting with ACOG this week and NATS (along with AGS) next week. EAL have had approval for the monies requested from the DfT. Things are about to move and timelines will be produced along with engagement plans. Previous documentation, including the Statement of Need will be reviewed for existing rationale although the project for modernisation still stands and stage 1A had already been accepted. Stage 3 is when full consultation is required, and EAL need to make sure that this consultation is not run at the same time as the Noise Action Plan. There is work to do for both and the Aviation subgroup, as well as the board, will be kept updated.</p> <p>A request was made for an update on implementation of the NAP and also the work required for the NAP going forward which may tie in with work that EANAB have in their work action plan. More information was requested on Continuous Climb Operations (CCO) and Continuous Descent Approaches (CDA) and what effect this has. Work was suggested on noise profiling for CDA's and CCO's and to correlate with actual noise monitoring. It seems some aircraft "step on the gas" when ascending which creates more noise on the ground – though EAL say aircraft 100% comply, how is that demonstrated in real time information? Why are some flights noisier than others?</p> <p>Can EAL look at noise modelling and the way aircraft are flying SIDs and is there a quick win? Part of Stage 2 of the ACP will be looking at flight path options and there is very little opportunity of a quick win. The PPR part of CAP1616 (Appendix I) seems to reduce any ability to introduce minor amendments.</p> <p>There was a general discussion on some flights being noisier than others. Could research be done into flight profiling? Is it aircraft types or the way they are flown? A lot of the answers here are to do with aircraft type, stage of flight, destination, weight etc.</p> <p>What is required is some information about aircraft noise that can be passed on to the communities. There are many parameters affecting aircraft noise, but more detail is required and has previously been requested. EANAB would like to see EAL proactively pursuing projects or ways to understand noise. EAL to</p>	<p>EAL</p> <p>EAL</p>

	provide further information/real data on aircraft noise to the Aviation subgroup that can be passed on to communities.	EAL
6	Matters Arising/Actions (not covered above) See the updated action list below – new information provided in blue.	
7	AOB The numbering system under ID for actions in matters arising was queried: this refers to the number of the meeting and subsequent sections numbers and paragraphs. It was suggested there might be a way of making the action list more useful, e.g. referencing letters listed. The governance group could work with the minutes secretary on a way of making the action list more useful.	Gov SG/KW
	<p>Thanks were expressed to SR for attending today's meeting.</p> <p>RF passed on his thanks for the Boards best wishes.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Date of Next Meeting</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Subject to confirmation, the next meeting of the Board will be held on Wednesday 2nd June 2021</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Meeting closed at 2135</p>	

Matters Arising/Actions

Item	ID	Matter arising/action description	Responsible	Date raised	Date closed
1	35.7.3	Letter regarding opportunities to reduce and mitigate noise while the aviation industry is reopening was sent by Chair mid-July 2020 to EAL, CAA & Hannah Bardell. No responses yet received.	CHAIR	July 2020	
	44.4	"Build back better" reminder discussed & response from EAL requested.	EAL	April 2021	
	44.4	EAL to come back to EANAB when they can to discuss their plans for noise mitigation as the airport opens up	EAL/GR	April 2021	
2	39.4	A draft letter to be circulated for board approval addressed to MPs and MSPs (including Alex Cole Hamilton) exploring the potential for further funding. To be sent after the 6 th May elections Final draft to be resent to those who request it	AC AC/ALL AC	Nov 2020 Apr 2021 5 May 2021	
3	41.2.11	Minutes Secretary No further funds available from CCs. Ongoing Action: volunteers welcome.	Ongoing/ALL	Nov 2020	<i>Ongoing</i>

	44.1.1	KW and SR to take over production of minutes until formal minutes secretary funds are reinstated	KW/SR	7 April 2021	
4	30.6.3	The Chair noted that the Planning and Noise report was received from RC of EACC and suggested this is dealt with by email outside of the meeting. Subsequent to contact with EACC will continue via email. JH to report back once she has met with RC to get clarification. JH and RC cannot recollect this matter. LG to review and email the Chair	Ongoing Chair LG/Chair	Feb 2020 Apr 2021	5 May 2021
5	32.7.3	It was noted that a document charting the process of determining design principles for the ACP appeared to conclude principles that in some cases ignored basic principles established in consultations. As an example, an intent of "No Change to Flightpaths" appears to be ignored in final conclusions. Awaiting reactivation of ACP	ALL/CHAIR ONGOING	Apr 2020	
6	40.5.1	Aviation Sub-Group Dates were awaited from EAL to meet to develop EAL/EANAB co-operation on the ACP and the benefits of flight profiling. <i>EAL is in contact with ACOG and is awaiting information on re-activating the ACP together with feedback from the DfT; regarding requests for funding.</i>	SR (EAL) ONGOING EAL(SR) ONGOING	Dec 2020	Ongoing
7	41.5.5.1	Health SG Precis of the ICCAN report to be uploaded to EANAB website - published	PP/AC	Apr 2021	April 2021
8	42.9.3	Further to discussion on Planning matters it was agreed that a draft letter to West Lothian Planning be prepared regarding the proposed development at Drumshoreland Road/Clapperton Hall. EAL (JMcC) to provide assistance when able. Draft letter circulated 5 April 2021 by RG & supported for sending. EANAB to liaise with EAL to finalise the letter. Closing date of 10 May flagged therefore Chair/RG to send letter on behalf of EANAB asap. Ref Drumshoreland development, a local CC met with the Head of WL development and management who said that the planning application for 2000 houses would probably not be put through. He commented that aircraft noise was treated as intermittent rather than a continuous noise though literature indicates that intermittent noise is worse than continuous noise. Local council & residents have objected to this development on a number of grounds and have included information from the relevant noise maps. It was noted that councillors can overturn planning officer recommendations (e.g. the Newbridge roundabout	LG/RG/JMcC MA/RG/JMcC Chair/RG	3 Feb 2021 April 2021 5 May 2021	

		where planning was granted against environmental health issues.)			
9	43.4.3	Night-time flights Some further discussion would take place in the sub-group on the definition of night and the further questions. Ongoing discussions to continue through all relevant sub-groups.	TL	3 Mar 2021	Ongoing
	43.4.3	Question: which regulations govern the definition of “night-time”? Chair to advise. Lack of clarity – no unity between airports/countries and none follow WHO guidelines.	Chair	7 April 2021	5 May 2021
	43.4.3	EAL wants to be clear and have a discussion on night-time hours. It could be part of the ACP.NAP or do they change to WHO definitions? No national guidance. Commercial operation against the needs of communities. Suggestion to look at the environmental nuisance noise regulations and other industry constraints. ICCAN are looking at night flying and EANAB should be feeding into this discussion as legislation will come.	EAL	7 April 2021	
	45.6	Can EANAB and EAL achieve something together regarding night flying hours that affect our communities – to be discussed with GR.	SR & Chair to take forward to EAL	5 May 2021	
10	43.5.1	Arrangements for a separate meeting on governance (from previous items 42.9.1 & 42.9.4) This will be an extraordinary meeting to discuss the broader sense of governance and to look at available dates and who may be available to chair the meeting. Previous items to be included: Complaint raised in July 2020; alleged conspiracy; issues raised within a resignation email (dated 2 Feb 21); division within the board. Board members to feedback on the email issued 7 April 21 with mediation options to progress the governance issues. <u>Poor feedback received but agreed by all board members on Webex that we must find a way forward and should use the mediation option to resolve the outstanding complaint. Practical details to be arranged and distributed.</u>	BF ALL BF	3 Mar 2021 7 April 2021 May 2021	
11	43.8.3	Digital Library. Compilation of documents into a digital library has been started. The library will be built up over time and any contributions would be appreciated.	Ongoing/ALL	7 April 2021	Ongoing
12	44.1	March 2021 minutes to be approved	Chair	7 April 2021	
13	44.1.2	EAL to provide information in writing/email on the recording issue by drawing attention to the relevant documentation or legal paragraphs. Email circulated to board on 26 April 2021	EAL/GR	7 April 2021	26 April 2021

14	44.4	EAL to present to EANAB on how ICCAN's published corporate strategy on the future of aviation noise will affect EAL in the next month or two	EAL	7 April 2021	
15	44.4	SR to keep EANAB up to date and involved with the Forth issues/NATS discussions through the Aviation sub-group	SR/Aviation SG	7 April 2021	<i>Ongoing</i>
16	44.4 & 44.7.2	CAP1616 (Part 3) is dedicated to transparency and engagement and EAL are happy to provide monthly ACP updates .	SR	7 April 2021	<i>Ongoing</i>
17	44.4	Any aircraft that might not have FOPP modifications (eg night cargo aircraft) are to be clarified	SR to Aviation SG	7 April 2021	
18	44.6.2	All to read email from TW (2 April 2021) & feedback is requested on ideas for the Strategic Review sub group via email.	ALL	7 April 2021	5 May 2021
19	44.6.2 45.4	The annual review is to be completed by the end of this month. Sub-group leaders to provide information quickly. All members to feedback on drafts of the Annual Report before final publication at the end of May	ALL ALL	7 April 2021 5 May 2021	
20	44.6.3	ICCAN report on the future of aviation noise management now available and to be reviewed	ICCAN SG	7 April 2021	
21	44.6.5	Chair to inform both parties of a new complaint and arrange for an ad hoc group to look at it.	Chair	7 April 2021	5 May 2021
22	44.6.5 45.5.5	Volunteers required for ad hoc group to look at new complaint (please email the Chair) Any volunteers for the reconstitution of the Governance subgroup to send an email to BF or AC	ALL ALL	7 April 2021 5 May 2021	See 45.5.5
23	44.7.1	EAL to liaise/report back to EANAB with reference to EALs land use planning and strategy	EAL	7 April 2021	
NEW ACTIONS					
24	45.2	The minutes secretary should liaise with the meeting facilitator for the recordings of meetings and if anyone attending that meeting requires access to recorded information, they should liaise with the minutes secretary.	KW/PP/ALL	5 May 2021	<i>Ongoing</i>
25	45.3	Chair to pass on information about EANRP interviews to TL	Chair	5 May 2021	
26	45.5.1	Board members to review and pass comment on the Aviation subgroup email of 5 May 2021.	ALL	5 May 2021	
27	45.5.3	All board members to feed requests to ICCAN subgroup for discussions with Charles Lloyd, ANEG and/or ICCAN.	ALL	5 May 2021	
28	45.5.3	The board is responding to the CAA consultation on night flying (31 st May deadline) and the Aviation subgroup is to liaise with the ICCAN subgroup.	MA/TL/HP	5 May 2021	
29	45.5.3	CAAI training information to be circulated to the board. <i>Post meeting note: information emailed 6 May 2021</i>	BF	5 May 2021	6 May 2021
30	45.5.3	Feedback from the last workshop will be distributed internally within the group once received	AC/KW	5 May 2021	

31	45.5.4	AC to approach the Royal Society of Edinburgh about the possibility of advice and information	AC	5 May 2021	
32	45.5.6	EAL to provide: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • an update on NAP implementation; • look at noise modelling and the way aircraft are flying SIDs and • further information/real data on aircraft noise to the Aviation subgroup that can be passed on to communities. 	EAL	5 May 2021	
33	45.7	Governance group to work with minutes secretary on referencing in the actions list to make it more useful	Gov subgroup/ KW	5 May 2021	