



Edinburgh Airport Noise Advisory Board

**Note of Record – Forty Seventh Meeting held on
Wednesday 7th July 2021 by Webex**

Commencing at 6.30pm

Present: Lindsay Cole (Chair)

Merv Archibald (MA), Blackness Area CC; Bruce Finlayson (BF), North Queensferry CC; Sharon Gibson (SG), Pumpherston CC; Tom Leatherland (TL), Limekilns and Charleston CC; Neil Lovett (NL) East Calder CC; Pippa Plevin (PP), JFCCWL; Karen Walker (KW) Blackness Area CC; Andrew Watt (AW), Dalkeith & District CC & Midlothian Federation CC; Tom Wylie (TW) Cramond and Barnton CC; Ray Godfree (RG), Ratho & District CC; Louise Gunstensen (LG), Dalgety Bay & Hillend CC; Adam Cumming (AC), Cramond Association; Helena Paul (HP), Blackness Area CC/EAW; Vic Garrad (VG), Kirknewton CC

In attendance: Simon Rhodes (SR) EAL , Mari Finlayson (MF), North Queensferry CC

Apologies: Ray Flint (RF), Kinghorn CC

ITEM		ACTION
1.1	Approval of Previous Minutes and Public Domain Reminder The June 2021 minutes were accepted by MA and seconded by AW.	Publish minutes
1.2	Unapproved March 2021 Minutes Amended March minutes with changes to address the sticking points had been circulated prior to this meeting as Revision C which was rejected (reasons included additional text in item 16 which did not make sense and item 25 required further clarification). Discussions to be taken offline for agreement. The February minutes were only previously accepted subject to additional content which was queried - it was stated that the additional content had	KW/RG/ BF/MF

	<p>on aircraft noise and this will be presented to the board (probably September 2021) and provide a framework for future community engagement – EANAB members query when EAL might engage with the board in order to have some input before it is finalised and SR will look in to this.</p> <p>As EAL was recovering and staff were returning, this was the ideal opportunity for this. The NAP still needs to be written and consulted on but EAL are awaiting the Scottish Government's requirements which EAL will have to comply with. An update on the current NAP and any government requirements will be provided for the next meeting.</p> <p>It was noted that a number of EAL actions could be collated in the actions table.</p> <p>The issue of a green tick for transparency from the CAA was flagged but this was without consultation with EANAB. This might be in reference to the accessibility of the noise monitor online or the ACP and confirmation is to be provided.</p> <p>EANAB were not consulted on the sustainability strategy published by EAL and are therefore no better off than the public in their awareness despite being the noise advisory board for EA. EAL is doing pieces of work and EANAB have been asking to be consulted - this point is to be taken away by EAL for discussion and referred back.</p>	<p>EAL</p> <p>SR/EAL</p> <p>SR/GR/EAL</p> <p>KW/SR</p> <p>SR/EAL</p> <p>SR/EAL</p>
<p>3</p>	<p>EANRP up-date</p> <p>There was a meeting of the review panel 3 weeks ago looking at survey responses which have been collated and grouped. Responses (48) received through social media were difficult to categorize as many of these people had not heard of EANAB and a lot of answers raised general queries such as individual flights/noise rather than EANAB. Community council responses were also being collated and they were more aware of EANAB and that some information was being passed on to the public. The 3 groups were working together to make the best of this information and more information will be provided at the August meeting. The review panel are within 2 or 3 weeks of producing a report and a list of recommendations. Some board/RP interviews were outstanding and the completion of these was being looked at but action 45.3 could be closed. It was queried whether the survey should have asked about awareness of community councils instead of EANAB? There is perhaps some failure at that level.</p> <p>Unfortunately, due to anonymity and confidentiality, those individuals who made comment about noise issues cannot be followed up and it was not known whether there was a pattern to these observations.</p>	<p>45.3 closed</p>
<p>4</p>	<p>Aviation Taxation Consultation</p>	

	<p>EANAB's response to this consultation was circulated before it was submitted. There were two parts to it.</p> <p>The first part was on halving APD by only charging one leg of a journey. Simply cutting APD is not in alignment with the government's aim for Net Zero emissions by 2050. A suggestion was made that APD should but cut for fuel efficient aircraft. An idea proposed is that targets could be set for fuel efficiency and financial incentives given to meet these.</p> <p>The second part was the APD for long haul flights. This is currently based on distances between capital cities. Different banding systems throw up strange anomalies (for instance the same APD for Boston and San Francisco). APD should be based on distance between airports, and this is not beyond modern technology. This was in EANAB's response.</p> <p>Since this response was submitted, Scotland's Committee on Climate Change has laid its recommendations in parliament (email circulated to the board on 24th June 2021) and was critical of the lack of strategy for aviation. Aviation and shipping are now included in the UK's carbon budget so the government will now have to do something about this to balance the carbon books.</p>	
5	Up-Dates from Subgroups	
5.1	<p>Aviation</p> <p>There had been no recent meetings and one will be arranged for next month. There are outstanding actions from EAL to be progressed. An email has been received from the MoD about the North Sea training area - both EAL and EANAB will be engaged in the Stage 2 process of this.</p> <p>EAL updated that Stage 1 of the EAL ACP had been resubmitted and are hoping for a positive response by the end of July and actions were being taken to remobilise consultants for Stage 2. ACP update to be provided at the August board meeting. EAL meetings to be held with NERL, ACOG, WSP, To70 Glasgow and others with engagement workshops to be arranged for September or October 2021 which will include EANAB. Stage 2 now runs until July 2022, a longer time period than originally planned.</p> <p>EAL are now part of a masterplan which is being written for the airspace modernization strategy master plan for the north and south and also working with ACOG on this – the master plan will be published by the end of 2021. One option is to look at what the present-day flight paths are and then look to improve them (eg using the Forth, wider turn over Fife). The process requires engagement with stakeholders at workshops (possibly September) and a project timescale for any involvement with the airspace modernization strategy will be given to the subgroup.</p> <p>There was a request for the aviation subgroup to have updates on the ACP and SR agreed that monthly updates will be sent via email (along with other reports he has to send out).</p> <p>Comments had previously been made about workshop input by CCs and the lack of connection on what had subsequently been produced as the final</p>	<p>GR/EAL</p> <p>SR</p> <p>SR</p>

	<p>SG leaders to do a quick overview note to the Strategy SG to confirm active subgroups so that the website can be updated accordingly.</p> <p>The Noise SG asked EAL if they responded to the aviation tax consultation and although it was unknown by the EAL member present, the airport and various employees do discuss a multitude of issues with governments (both Scottish and UK) on a continual basis especially through the Covid pandemic so the airports views on aviation taxation will be well known at government level.</p>	<p>SG leaders/SSG /PP</p>
5.3	<p>Engaging with other bodies: EACC & ICCAN</p> <p>Nothing to report from ICCAN.</p> <p>The EACC meet next month (Mon 9th Aug) and the public can attend. AC did attend the previous EACC on behalf of Crammond at which there was a brief on the airport's sustainability strategy and noise was mentioned in that EAL agreed with the ICCAN proposals and would be working on them. There was also a discussion on the economic crisis affecting the airport.</p>	
5.4	<p>Health</p> <p>The HSG leader is aware of a PhD student who is working on the subject of noise and will follow up with the health contact involved at Queen Mary College via email.</p> <p>No luck with a contact with the RSE - action ongoing</p> <p>The document from action 45.5.3 and 46.5.4 has been drafted and will be circulated to members and published.</p> <p>There is an online meeting with ICCAN re noise modelling & NAPD on 13 July (email circulated on 25th June for member's diaries).</p> <p>It was flagged that Christine Jardine MP has put in a private members bill for WHO targets and thresholds for air quality in the UK and as a board member (& constituent) has previously corresponded with Christine Jardine MP, they will liaise via email with the other interested member.</p>	<p>AC</p> <p>AC</p> <p>AC</p> <p>AC/LG</p>
5.5	<p>Governance</p> <p>Most progress had been made on the complaints procedure which is the most urgent with 4 complaints under consideration. One complaint outstanding for a year is presently in mediation. A high standard solution was sought out however Scottish Government guidelines were thought inappropriate, so Fife CC guidelines have been adapted to our local needs. The final details were being worked on before circulation.</p> <p>Guidelines for press statements, guidelines for the chair, a review of standing orders and ToR & CoC were all being worked on.</p> <p>Google documents are being used to update procedures which is also useful for version control.</p> <p>It has also been agreed by the GSG that training requirements on governance should be addressed so that we might change the culture within the board and remind ourselves of the need of duty of care for each other and ensure compliance. Ideally members on the governance subgroup</p>	

	<p>would be able to access mediation training and this would be requested from a budget from EAL.</p> <p>It was clarified that once the present mediation is concluded, there will be an extraordinary meeting as discussed and actioned previously (43.5.1).</p>	
5.6	<p>Other</p> <p>Noise SG Three quarterly noise reports are overdue because of the pandemic and availability of staff. It is hoped that these will resume soon. The noise complaint system is up and working although the process is not as quick as it has been previously, but it hoped that normal service will be resumed as soon as EAL can.</p> <p>CC members have had complaints from the public that it is hard to find how to submit noise complaints via the airport website. The portal may have been down, but the noise complaint procedure can be found by searching on the internet for “noise, Edinburgh and airport”. There is also a direct link to the EAL noise website on the EANAB website. Or the public can send complaints direct to noise@edinburghairport.com</p> <p>It has been extremely difficult to establish which flights are included in the charging scheme (night flight penalty payment) however the EAL member present was unaware of the commercial agreements of cargo flights or if passenger flights scheduled for before 6am or at 6am are levied a penalty payment if they depart early (e.g. 5.50am). EAL to get back to EANAB with clarification on night flight penalty payments.</p> <p>A request had been made to EAL to make communities section more visible (as it is currently buried in the corporate section) on the Airport Website. It was suggested it be renamed as the “corporate and community” section perhaps?</p>	<p>SR/EAL</p> <p>SR/EAL</p> <p>EAL</p>
6	<p>Matters Arising/Actions (not covered above)</p> <p>See the updated action list tabulated below – new information provided in blue.</p> <p>Reminder per section 2 above that EAL had a number of outstanding actions which are to be collated and presented on next month.</p> <p>Aviation SG to check if previous action 45.5.1 (email of 5th May) can be closed</p> <p>It was noted that the matters arising and actions table seems to be working well and it was asked if members might use the Google Drive to update the Action Table however this idea was not supported (some prefer a paper copy). The table might be further improved by being colour coded the same</p>	<p>SR/EAL/KW</p> <p>MA/KW</p>

	as the Strategy SG table. Any other ideas on how to improve the table are welcome.	
7	AOB The Chair has had no response from the planning letter submitted.	
	<p>Thanks to SR for attending today's meeting</p> <p>Date of Next Meeting</p> <p>Subject to confirmation, the next meeting of the Board will be held on Wednesday 4th August 2021</p> <p>Meeting closed at 8:30 pm</p>	

Actions and Matters Arising discussed/closed on 7th July 2021

Item	ID	Matter arising/action description	Responsible	Date raised	Date closed
1	35.7.3	Letter regarding opportunities to reduce and mitigate noise while the aviation industry is reopening was sent by Chair mid-July 2020 to EAL, CAA & Hannah Bardell. No responses yet received.	CHAIR	July 2020	
	44.4	"Build back better" reminder discussed & response from EAL requested.	EAL	April 2021	
	44.4	EAL to come back to EANAB when they can to discuss their plans for noise mitigation as the airport opens up	EAL/GR	April 2021	
	47.2	Work ongoing to produce an "arrive back better" strategy/discussion document on aircraft noise and this will be presented to the board (probably September 2021). EAL to advise when they might engage with EANAB in order for the board to have some input before the "arrive back better" strategy is finalised.	EAL EAL/SR	7 July 2021	
2	41.2.11	Minutes Secretary No further funds available from CCs.		Nov 2020	<i>Ongoing</i>
	44.1.1	Ongoing Action: volunteers welcome. KW and SR to take over production of minutes until formal minutes secretary funds are reinstated	Ongoing/ALL KW/SR	7 April 2021	

3	32.7.3	<p>It was noted that a document charting the process of determining design principles for the ACP appeared to conclude principles that in some cases ignored basic principles established in consultations. As an example, an intent of “No Change to Flightpaths” appears to be ignored in final conclusions. Awaiting reactivation of ACP <i>ACP reactivated May 2021</i> therefore interaction with EAL now required ACP update to be provided at the August board meeting.</p>	<p>ALL/CHAIR ONGOING</p> <p>ALL/CHAIR/EAL</p> <p>GR/EAL</p>	<p>Apr 2020</p> <p>2 June 2021</p> <p>7 July 2021</p>	
4	<p>40.5.1</p> <p>47.5.1</p>	<p>Aviation Sub-Group Dates were awaited from EAL to meet to develop EAL/EANAB co-operation on the ACP and the benefits of flight profiling. EAL is in contact with ACOG and is awaiting information on re-activating the ACP together with feedback from the DfT; regarding requests for funding. <i>ACP reactivated May 2021</i> therefore information from EAL now required ACP update to be provided at the August board meeting. Agreed that monthly updates on the ACP will be sent via email to the ASG. A project timescale for any involvement with the airspace modernization strategy will be provided to the ASG.</p>	<p>SR (EAL) ONGOING</p> <p>EAL(SR) ONGOING</p> <p>EAL(SR)</p> <p>GR/EAL</p> <p>SR</p> <p>SR</p>	<p>Dec 2020</p> <p>2 June 2021</p> <p>7 July 2021</p>	<p><i>Ongoing</i></p>
5	<p>43.4.3</p> <p>45.6</p>	<p>Night-time flights EAL wants to be clear and have a discussion on night-time hours. It could be part of the ACP.NAP or do they change to WHO definitions? No national guidance. Commercial operation against the needs of communities. Suggestion to look at the environmental nuisance noise regulations and other industry constraints. ICCAN are looking at night flying and EANAB should be feeding into this discussion as legislation will come. Can EANAB and EAL achieve something together regarding night flying hours that affect our communities – to be discussed with GR.</p>	<p>EAL</p> <p>SR & Chair to take forward to EAL</p>	<p>7 April 2021</p> <p>5 May 2021</p>	

	47.5.6	EAL to get back to EANAB with clarification on night flight penalty payments.	SR/EAL	7 July 2021	
6	43.5.1	<p>Arrangements for a separate meeting on governance (from previous items 42.9.1 & 42.9.4)</p> <p>This will be an extraordinary meeting to discuss the broader sense of governance and to look at available dates and who may be available to chair the meeting. Previous items to be included: Complaint raised in July 2020; alleged conspiracy; issues raised within a resignation email (dated 2 Feb 21); division within the board.</p> <p>Poor feedback received on the email issued 7 April 21 but <u>agreed by all board members</u> on Webex that we must find a way forward and should use the mediation option to resolve the outstanding complaint.</p> <p>Practical details to be arranged and distributed when appropriate</p> <p>Consent form to be returned by the Chair before any further progress can be made to arrange the mediation meeting.</p>	BF BF Chair	3 Mar 2021 May 2021 2 June 2021	8 June 2021
7	43.8.3	<p>Digital Library.</p> <p>Compilation of documents into a digital library has been started. The library will be built up over time and any contributions would be appreciated.</p>	Ongoing/ALL	7 April 2021	<i>Ongoing</i>
8	44.1 46.7 47.1.2	<p>March 2021 minutes to be approved</p> <p>RG circulated last version (Rev B) 17 June 2021 To be addressed at the July meeting and listed as an agenda item.</p> <p>Updated Rev C circulated prior to the July meeting was rejected and Rev D to be drafted for consideration</p>	Chair Chair/All KW/RG/BF/MF All	7 April 2021 2 June 2021 7 July 2021	
9	44.4	EAL to present to EANAB on how ICCAN's published corporate strategy on the future of aviation noise will affect EAL in the next month or two	EAL	7 April 2021	
10	44.4	SR to keep EANAB up to date and involved with the Forth issues/NATS discussions through the Aviation sub-group	SR/Aviation SG	7 April 2021	<i>Ongoing</i>

11	44.4 & 44.7.2	CAP1616 (Part 3) is dedicated to transparency and engagement and EAL are happy to provide monthly ACP updates.	SR	7 April 2021	<i>Ongoing</i>
12	44.4	EAL confirmed that FOPP modifications have been fitted to all Airbus aircraft using Edinburgh airport and is not relevant to Boeings which are the aircraft routinely used for night cargo.	SR to Aviation SG	7 April 2021	Closed
13	44.6.2 45.4 46.2	The annual review is to be completed by the end of this month. Sub-group leaders to provide information quickly. All members to feedback on drafts of the Annual Report before final publication at the end of May. All comments received were helpful and publication will proceed after a final check of V8 by close of this week	ALL ALL TL/HP/LG	7 April 2021 5 May 2021 2 June 2021	Closed 7 June 2021
14	44.6.3	ICCAN report on the future of aviation noise management now available and to be reviewed	ICCAN SG	7 April 2021	
15	44.7.1	EAL to liaise/report back to EANAB with reference to EALs land use planning and strategy	EAL	7 April 2021	
16	45.2	The minutes secretary should liaise with the meeting facilitator for the recordings of meetings and if anyone attending that meeting requires access to recorded information, they should liaise with the minutes secretary.	KW/PP/ALL	5 May 2021	<i>Ongoing</i>
17	45.3	Chair to pass on information about EANRP interviews to TL Chair to provide further email information to anyone who wishes to speak to the Review Panel	Chair Chair	5 May 2021 2 June 2021	Closed 7 July 2021
18	45.5.1	Board members to review and pass comment on the Aviation subgroup email of 5 May 2021.	ALL	5 May 2021	7 July 2021
19	45.5.3	All board members to feed requests to ICCAN subgroup for discussions with Charles Lloyd, ANEG and/or ICCAN.	ALL	5 May 2021	
20	45.5.3	The board is responding to the CAA consultation on night flying (31 st May deadline) and the Aviation subgroup is to liaise with the ICCAN subgroup. Updates to the website for part 2 of this night flying consultation have led to a new deadline	MA/TL/HP TL/MA/HP	5 May 2021 2 June 2021	

		of early Sep 2021 – sub groups to liaise over the summer months			
21	45.5.3	Feedback from the last ICCAN workshop will be distributed internally within the group once received	AC/KW	5 May 2021	
	46.5.4	Any other health updates from ICCAN to be presented/circulated to the board - pending	Health SG AC	2 June 2021	
22	45.5.4	AC to approach the Royal Society of Edinburgh about the possibility of advice and information	AC	5 May 2021	
	47.5.4	AC to follow up with a health contact at Queen Mary College	AC	7 July 2021	
23	45.5.6	EAL to provide: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • an update on NAP implementation; • look at noise modelling and the way aircraft are flying SIDs and • further information/real data on aircraft noise to the Aviation subgroup that can be passed on to communities. 	EAL	5 May 2021	
	47.2	An update on the current NAP and any government requirements will be provided at the August 2021 meeting	EAL	7 July 2021	
24	45.7	Governance group to work with minutes secretary on referencing in the actions list to make it more useful	Gov subgroup/ KW	5 May 2021	
25	46.5.2	Chair to include Strategy on the agenda for July's meeting.	Chair	2 June 2021	7 July 2021
26	46.5.3	Update from last EACC meeting to be provided at July's meeting.	AC	2 June 2021	7 July 2021
27	46.5.5	Any comments on the Governance SG meeting notes to be sent to MA before publication with relevant appendices.	Gov SG	2 June 2021	June 2021
28	46.5.5	Chair to return the required consent form for mediation meeting progression.	Chair	2 June 2021	8 June 2021
29	46.5.6	The last 3 quarterly noise reports to be provided by EAL. Still outstanding as of 7 July 2021 but hopefully to resume soon.	EAL	2 June 2021	
30	46.7	Chair to inform the Gov SG of any outstanding complaints	Chair	2 June 2021	June 2021
NEW ACTION ITEMS FROM 7 JULY 2021					
31	47.1.2	February meeting minute Discussions to be taken offline for agreement.	KW/RG/BF/	7 July 2021	
32	47.1.2	March meeting minute discussions to be taken offline and a revision D to be drafted	KW/RG/BF/MF	7 July 2021	

33	47.2	EAL have developed a sustainability strategy and GR is to attend August's meeting and present.	GR	7 July 2021	
34	47.2	EAL actions to be collated - EAL only items collated and forwarded to SR	SR/KW	7 July 2021	22 July 2021
35	47.2	Clarification of the green tick for transparency from the CAA without consultation with EANAB to be provided (perhaps accessibility of the noise monitor online or the ACP?).	SR/EAL	7 July 2021	
36	47.2	EAL is doing pieces of work (e.g. sustainability strategy) and EANAB have been asking to be consulted - this point is to be taken away by EAL for discussion and referred back.	SR/EAL	7 July 2021	
37	47.5.2	SG leaders should discuss the development of each SG strategy with their SG members and feedback using the drafted format	SG leaders	7 July 2021	
38	47.5.2	EANABs strategy document to be forwarded to SR at EAL	TW	7 July 2021	
39	47.5.2	SG leaders to do a quick overview note to the Strategy SG to confirm active subgroups so that the website can be updated accordingly.	SG leaders/ SSG/PP	7 July 2021	
40	47.5.4	Two board members to liaise re the private members bill on air quality by Christine Jardine MP	AC/LG	7 July 2021	
41	47.5.6	Request for EAL to make the communities section more visible on the EAL website	SR/EAL	7 July 2021	