

## EDINBURGH AIRPORT NOISE ADVISORY BOARD

### Note of Record – Forty Third Meeting held on Wednesday 3rd March 2021

#### By internet link

#### Commencing at 6.30pm

**Present:** Lindsay Cole (Chair)

Merv Archibald (MA), Blackness Area CC; Adam Cumming (AC) Cramond Association; Bruce Finlayson (BF), North Queensferry CC; Sharon Gibson (SG), Pumpherston CC; Ray Godfree (RG), Ratho & District CC; Tom Leatherland (TL), Limekilns and Charleston CC; Neil Lovett (NL) East Calder CC (*part time*); Pippa Plevin (PP), Joint Forum of Community Councils in West Lothian; Karen Walker (KW) Blackness Area CC; Andrew Watt (AW), Dalkeith & District CC & Midlothian Federation CC; Tom Wylie (TW) Cramond and Barnton CC; Helena Paul (HP), Blackness Area CC/EAW; Vic Garrad (VC) Kirknewton CC. Louise Gunstensen (LG), Dalgety Bay & Hillend CC

**In attendance:** Simon Rhodes (SR) EAL  
Mari Finlayson

**Apologies:** Ray Flint (RF) Kinghorn CC (received post meeting)

The Chair welcomed members to the meeting and made a statement regarding the previous laissez faire approach to chairing these meetings aimed at encouraging contributions, but in recognising this might not be appropriate was now requesting that board members use the electronic “hand up” approach when they wish to contribute to the meeting.

The Chair also addressed previous attendance of a valued contributor to the EANAB who is a second (alternate) rather than a full member and moving forward is welcome as an observer only. Responding to a request by this alternate member to make a statement it was agreed they would respond under item 25 of matters arising.

ITEM		ACTION
1	<b>Approval of Previous Minutes</b>  Further to discussion relating to the content of the circulated draft minutes of the previous meeting held on 3 <sup>rd</sup> February 2021 the minutes were approved subject to the inclusion of additional content presented by a member, further to proposal (SG) and seconding (BF)	
2	<b>Matters Arising from previous meetings</b>	
2.1	As included in the following table	

Item	Matter arising/action description	Responsible	Date raised	Date closed
1 35.5.2	GR to attend a meeting to clarify his press announcement and ICCANs involvement in the review. <i>Whilst noting it would have been useful in hindsight if the correspondence between the Chair and GR had been made available at the time this item could have been resolved previously it was noted for ongoing Action:</i> <i>Chair to email GR and copy the board on an invitation for GR to attend the March meeting</i>  <i>Chair to invite GR to the April meeting.</i>	CHAIR/GR  CHAIR  CHAIR	July 2020  Feb 2021  Mar 2021	
2 35.7.3	Letter regarding opportunities to reduce and mitigate noise while the aviation industry is reopening was sent by Chair mid-July 2020 to EAL, CAA & Hannah Bardell. No responses yet received. Noted many staff in EAL are on furlough and the same is likely for CAA staff. <b>Remains dormant awaiting response</b>	CHAIR	July 2020	
3 41.2.5	Provision of minutes secretary by EAL – <i>Noted difficulty in arranging an EAL staff member whilst they are on furlough – However SR (EAL) offered to do the minutes at the March meeting and check receipt of draft minutes through the noise@edinburghairport email address.</i>	EAL  RG/SR CLOSED	13 Jan 2021  Feb 2021	Mar 2021
4 39.4	A draft letter be circulated for board approval addressed to MPs and MSPs (including Alex Cole Hamilton) exploring the potential for further funding. Draft circulated 22 November but only some responses received. AC to re-circulate the draft letter for comments so that a final letter can be agreed at the next appropriate meeting <b>Drafting delayed – to be completed in next few days</b>	AC  AC/ALL  AC	Nov 2020  Feb 2021  Mar 2021	
5 39.5.5	Complaints EAL (JMcC) to collate charts and possibly add another category for night-time. It was noted a column in section 1.8 says zero complaints which implies some information is not being picked up a matter that should be investigated when EAL staff return from furlough in December. Deferred until EAL staff return from Furlough Refer to Item 10 immediately following <b>Covered elsewhere in minutes</b>		Nov 2020	Mar 2021
6 41.2.9	Night Flights SR (EAL) offered to progress the above matters in JMcC's absence on furlough. Concerns were raised	EAL/SR	Dec 2020	

	<p>that the number of night flights appeared to be increasing. Information regarding the types of these flights, e.g., freight, was requested. Also feedback on the night flight charging scheme had been requested some months ago and was still outstanding. SR reported that there were records for all flights undertaken so he would investigate this.</p> <p><i>Noted EAL (SR) has received further information and will provide a slide show of findings for the March meeting</i></p> <p><i>It was acknowledged that this would be very welcome as communities are noting disturbing night flights. Information regarding timings would also be useful as had been indicated would be available with the next quarterly report.</i></p> <p><b>EAA (SR) to provide a slide for the March meeting</b>  <b>Covered elsewhere in minutes</b></p>	<b>EAL/SR CLOSED</b>	Feb 2021	<b>Mar 2021</b>
7 41.2.11	<p>Minutes Secretary</p> <p>No further funds available from CCs.</p> <p><b>Ongoing Action: volunteers welcome, please contact RG. EAL to continue to provide the secretary</b></p>	Ongoing ALL/RG	Nov 2020	
8 30.6.3	<p>The Chair noted that the Planning and Noise report was received from RC of EACC and suggested this is dealt with by email outside of the meeting. Subsequent to contact with EACC will continue via email.</p> <p>JH to report back once she has met with RC to get clarification.</p>	<b>Ongoing Chair</b>	Feb 2020	
9 32.7.3	<p>It was noted that a document charting the process of determining design principles for the ACP appeared to conclude principles that in some cases ignored basic principles established in consultations. As an example, an intent of “No Change to Flightpaths” appears to be ignored in final conclusions</p> <p><b>Awaiting reactivation of ACP</b></p>	<b>ALL/CHAIR ONGOING</b>	Apr 2020	
10 40.5.1	<p>Aviation Consultancy Sub-Group</p> <p>Dates were awaited from EAL to meet to develop EAL/EANAB co-operation on the ACP and the benefits of flight profiling. <i>EAL is in contact with ACOG and is awaiting information on re-activating the ACP together with feedback from the DfT; regarding requests for funding.</i></p> <p><b>Ongoing</b></p>	SR (EAL) ONGOING	Dec 2020	
11 40.5.2	<p>SR also offered to try to obtain information regarding development sites under western flightpaths that had been held up due to JMcC being on furlough. RG to be copied into any response to MA. <i>SR confirms EAL</i></p>	SR (EAL) ONGOING	Dec 2020	

	<p><i>are aware and need to include this information in the ACP.</i></p> <p><i>Noted that this issue would be covered later under Item 6 of the agenda.</i></p>	<b>CLOSED</b>		<b>Mar 2021</b>
12 40.2.21	<p>Noted that the Department for Transport consultation on night flights and designated airports closes at the end of March 2021. It was agreed that the Board should respond particularly in relation to night flights. It was agreed that the ICCAN sub-group would co-ordinate this response with input from the Health sub-group which was looking into the health implications of night flights. <b>ONGOING note March deadline</b></p> <p><b><i>Covered elsewhere in minutes</i></b></p>	ALL/AC ICCAN SG ONGOING	Dec 2020	<b>Mar 2021</b>
13 41.5.2.1	<p>Outer airways subgroup</p> <p>It was noted that the SG had asked if it could observe the early discussions on route plans and it is being considered.</p> <p><i>EAL (SR) confirmed stakeholders, including EANAB, have to be involved in discussions as and when the ACP is reactivated.</i></p>	EAL	13 Jan 2021	<b>Mar 2021</b>
14 41.5.5.1	<p>Health SG</p> <p>Ongoing action for a report/presentation to be discussed at a meeting in Jan 2021.</p> <p><i>Precis of the ICCAN report to be circulated to the board by AC who acknowledged that health issues are such a large specialist subject that the Health SG cannot analyse the data from reports and publications. It was noted that without the expertise required, the Health SG cannot investigate health matters and move anything forward for EANAB and is therefore essentially redundant and can only act as a conjugate for updated advice to the board such as that from ICCAN when available.</i></p> <p><b><i>Precis of the Report to be circulated the board</i></b></p> <p><b><i>Closed</i></b></p> <p><b><i>Upload to website outstanding</i></b></p>	Health SG	13 Jan 2021	
15 41.7.1	<p>It was noted that the Night Noise Consultation closes in early March and though it is more in relation to airports down south, it may result in more traffic to Scotland and therefore it should be investigated by EANAB Members prior to the closure date believed to be in March – possibly 3<sup>rd</sup> March.</p> <p><b><i>Actual date to be confirmed</i></b></p> <p><b><i>Covered elsewhere in minutes</i></b></p>	TL/ALL	13 Jan 2021	<b>Mar 2021</b>
16 42.3.1	<p>Noting that members queried that some potential stakeholders appeared to be missing from the Stakeholder list and whilst noting that the EANAB website has only ever listed Community Councils and Associations as represented organisations, a</p>			

	<p>subsequent discussion regarding membership of EANAB and the status of Edinburgh Airport Watch (EAW) was deferred to be determined under an agenda item at the next meeting in March.</p> <p><i>Noted that Review Panel has included EAW as a stakeholder and agreed that, until the Review Panel make their recommendations, {the representative of} EAW should be reinstated on the group emails and the status quo of board membership be maintained.</i></p>	<p><b>CHAIR</b></p> <p><b>CLOSED</b></p>	<p>3 Feb 2021</p>	<p>Mar 2012</p>
17 42.3.2	<p>Further to a comment made regarding the fact that there are no environmental groups or any other noise boards listed it was agreed this would be raised with the Review Panel.</p>	<p><b>CHAIR</b></p> <p><b>CLOSED</b></p>	<p>3 Feb 2021</p>	<p><b>Mar 2021</b></p>
18 42.5.1	<p>Following further discussion of various alternative airways it was agreed that the subgroups involved put forward proposed response points to the MoD from EANAB in relation to the ACP Design Principles and agreed that this would be a separate submission under CAP1616 for which the deadline is the 12th of February.</p> <p><i>Covered elsewhere in minutes</i></p>	<p><b>Aviation &amp; Outer Airways Subgroups</b></p> <p><b>CLOSED</b></p>	<p>3 Feb 2021</p>	<p><b>Mar 2021</b></p>
19 42.5.2	<p>EAL are responding first to the letter that they have received with points to consider. The dates and times that the military plan to use will have to be confirmed and pinned down but it is highlighted that these areas can be turned on and off using technology available these days which enables the flexible use of air space.</p> <p><i>Covered elsewhere in minutes</i></p>	<p><b>EAL</b></p> <p><b>CLOSED</b></p>	<p>3 Feb 2021</p>	<p><b>Mar 2021</b></p>
20 42.6	<p>The board was reminded that our role is to ensure accurate noise data is presented to the planners but control over who builds and buys houses is not within the remit of EANAB though we should endeavour to provide accurate noise information. <i>A joint responsibility in cooperation with EAL.</i></p>	<p><b>See item 23 below</b></p> <p><b>CLOSED</b></p>	<p>3 Feb 2021</p>	<p><b>Mar 2021</b></p>
21 42.7	<p><b>REVIEW OF ISSUES LOG</b></p> <p>There was a meeting on the 19th January with the new subgroup and another meeting is to be arranged. <i>Ongoing with volunteers required.</i></p>	<p><b>BF/AC/MA</b></p> <p><b>ONGOING</b></p>	<p>3 Feb 2021</p>	
22 42.9.1	<p><b>ANY OTHER BUSINESS</b></p> <p>Noting that a board member has recently resigned it was requested that members consider the issues raised within the resignation email for discussion in full at the next meeting in March.</p> <p><i>Deferred to separate meeting to be arranged for all Members to discuss the broader sense of governance. See item 24 below</i></p>	<p><b>CHAIR</b></p>	<p>3 Feb 2021</p> <p><b>3 Mar 2021</b></p>	

23 42.9.3	Further to discussion on Planning matters noted above under section 6 it was agreed that a draft letter to West Lothian Planning be prepared regarding the proposed development at Drumshoreland Road/Clapperton Hall. EAL (JMcC) to provide assistance when able.	LG/RG/JMcC	3 Feb 2021	
24 42.9.4	Following ongoing questions regarding the position of the Chair, as an alleged conspirator, continuing to manage the meeting it was determined that an action arising should be the arrangement of a special meeting with an independent Chair to discuss the Complaint raised in July 2020 together with the issues arising from documents as issued to members by the Complainant in November 2020. <i>It was noted this could be covered within a broader meeting of members incorporating issues related to a Complaint as noted above in item 22 of this schedule</i>	CHAIR/BF	3 Feb 2021  3 Mar 2021	
25 42.9.5	<b>State of the Board.</b> It was suggested by an observer that the Board is now a divided Board. It was agreed that the Chair would correspond by open emails looking at ways this might be addressed. <i>It was noted within the introduction to the meeting that the Chair had communicated with the alternate member by email to restrict their participation to be an observer only but did not communicate any ideas to resolve the divisions* as he had undertaken to do at the previous meeting.</i>  There followed a statement presented by an alternate member which included: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• their upset at the Chair's lack of action regarding the obvious divisions in the board;</li> <li>• the Chair's unsolicited moves to side-line that member;</li> <li>• the immoral way in which attempts have been made to remove another member;</li> <li>• the ethos which allows dismissal of opinions from board members without appropriate discussion;</li> <li>• the failure of the board to meet it's obligations to the communities affected by aircraft noise;</li> <li>• concerns that there are very few active unqualified volunteers on the board with no funding;</li> <li>• dismay that with 2 member resignations, the board appears to be trying to exclude further members;</li> </ul> The statement concluded that the member believed that they should be given the same consideration as others (regarding the deferment of governance	<b>CHAIR</b>  <b>CLOSED</b> <b>*matters to be addressed during the Special Meeting to be arranged</b>	3 Feb 2021	<b>MAR 2021</b>

	<p>issues) and that their position continues as it currently is.</p> <p>A member requested that the statement be tabled for the record. The Chair agreed.</p> <p>Thanks were given by the Chair for the statement, which was as always, worthwhile.</p> <p>It was tabled by a member that as Governance has been deferred to a special meeting and to consolidate the statement just made, that the board accept the status quo (the situation as of the end of 2020). This motion was seconded, and board members agreed.</p> <p><i>Post meeting note: the full statement was circulated to board members by email on 10th March 2021</i></p>			
--	--	--	--	--

<p><b>3</b></p>	<p><b>EANRP update</b></p> <p>The survey has been distributed and there have been more than 20 responses and there are over 500 stakeholders on the list. Others can be added if required and the link to the survey is widely available on the website and social media. The aim is to get the survey as widely distributed as possible.</p> <p>The survey went out on the 4<sup>th</sup> of February and there has been a subsequent meeting of the review panel. This meeting looked at the work to do in compiling responses and putting recommendations together going forward. Some responses to direct questions have already been compiled by EAL. The area of governance of the Board has also been initiated as a topic for the review panel.</p> <p>The Chair confirmed that EANRP meets every two weeks and they will keep EANAB updated at their monthly meetings.</p> <p>It was confirmed that members may pass on links to the survey to others, however it was noted that as “Survey Monkey” uses cookies, the survey can only be completed once on any particular device.</p> <p>A reminder email about the survey was due to be sent shortly to all stakeholders.</p> <p>Responding to a query as to whether the survey may be answered on paper it was noted there was a widely distributed email address to attach additional information to - if anyone would wish to whilst answering the survey.</p>	
<p><b>4</b></p> <p><b>4.1</b></p>	<p><b>Future Combat Airspace ACP</b></p> <p>The Aviation sub-group had submitted a response to the CAA with regard to ACP-2020-026 the proposal by the MoD for the FCA area out over the North Sea. MA thank all who had worked on a contribution.</p> <p>SR gave a presentation on this Future Combat Airspace, Night Noise and the Noise Action Plan (NAP). The presentation would be distributed after the meeting.</p>	<p><b>SR EAL</b></p>



	each sub-group detailing this work should be sent to MA for compilation.	<b>MA 3 Mar 21</b>
<b>7</b>	<p><b>Updates from Sub-Groups:</b></p> <p><b>Aviation</b></p> <p>The Aviation Consultancy and Outer Airways group have been amalgamated into the Aviation sub-group. Bi-monthly progress meetings are taking place with SR (EAL). EAL await funding for the ACP to reactivate and it is hoped that furloughed staff return soon so that some answers on how noise will be reduced can be provided.</p> <p><b>ICCAN</b></p> <p>An ICCAN newsletter was distributed this week and includes the subjects of noise insulation and the future of aviation noise management. The future framework on aviation noise management will be published later this month. ICCAN itself is undergoing a review as this is required every 2 years. ICCAN are also about to commence a survey on how aviation noise affects health and EANAB would be participating. AC would like to assist with this survey if possible. It will be interesting to see the impact of this review.</p> <p><b>Governance</b></p> <p>N/A at this meeting</p> <p><b>Other Groups</b></p> <p>N/A at this meeting</p>	
<b>8</b>	<p><b>ANY OTHER BUSINESS:</b></p> <p><b>Including DfT Night Flights and update on NAP</b></p> <p>(These points were discussed earlier)</p> <p><b>Fuel Over Pressure Plates.</b></p> <p>It was noted that FOPPs are metal plates that are attached forward of the fuel over pressure outflow cavity which allows smooth air flow over the small cavity thereby reducing noise during the aircraft's approach. This is of benefit to the communities below (it reduces the "whining" noise people hear). New planes are modified already &amp; it is likely to be older freight planes that are the biggest offender which is particularly pertinent to night flight noise. Any useful information should be included on EANABs website to explain this to communities. SR will research this further for the next meeting &amp; clarify what EAL are doing to encourage all airlines to make this alteration.</p> <p><b>Post meeting note:</b></p> <p>Information on this was received since the meeting:</p>	
<b>8.1</b>		<b>SR 3 Mar 21</b>

<p><b>8.2</b></p> <p><b>8.3</b></p>	<p>EasyJet can confirm that this is fitted to all their aircraft (They are a modification for the Airbus 320 family only so not relevant for Boeings etc.)</p> <p><b>Digital Library.</b> BF proposed to create a digital library on the EANAB website in conjunction with another board member. PP volunteered to assist. This would be relatively simple on a separate tab if required (like the current ICCAN tab for instance).</p> <p>A request was made for all members to send through any relevant documentation. KW offered to assist in compiling a list of documentation for ease of access when required.</p> <p>There being no further business the meeting closed at 8.26 pm</p>	<p><b>BF/PP</b></p> <p><b>ALL/KW</b> <b>3 Mar 21</b></p>
	<p><b>Date of Next Meeting</b> Subject to confirmation, the next meeting of the Board would be held on Wednesday 7<sup>th</sup> April 2021</p>	